These notes refer to the Youth Justice and Criminal Evidence Act 1999 (c.23) which received Royal Assent on 27 July 1999

## YOUTH JUSTICE AND CRIMINAL EVIDENCE ACT 1999

## **EXPLANATORY NOTES**

## **COMMENTARY ON SECTIONS**

Part II: Giving of evidence or information for purposes of criminal proceedings

Chapter VI: Restrictions on use of evidence

Section 58: Inferences from silence not permissible where no prior access to legal advice

- 196. This section amends the inferences from silence provisions in the Criminal Justice and Public Order Act 1994, to prohibit the drawing of inferences from silence when a suspect is questioned at a police station (or other authorised place of detention) while denied access to legal advice.
- 197. The effect of these provisions will be to bring the law into compliance with the judgment of the European Court of Human Rights in the case of John Murray v United Kingdom, which held that there was a breach of Article 6 of the European Convention on Human Rights as a result of denying the applicant access to legal advice in circumstances where inferences could be drawn from his silence during police questioning.
- 198. The provision inserted by *subsection* (5) empowers the Secretary of State to designate by regulation places of detention other than a police station. This is to take account of detention by other investigators such as HM Customs and Excise.